UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

In re:

Docket #1:19-cv-09038-

ANTOLINI, DINO, : GBD-SDA

Plaintiff, :

- against -

McCLOSKEY, AMY et al, : New York, New York

April 30, 2021

Defendants. :

TELEPHONE CONFERENCE

-----:

PROCEEDINGS BEFORE

THE HONORABLE JUDGE STEWART D. AARON,
UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT MAGISTRATE JUDGE

APPEARANCES:

For Plaintiff: FINKELSTEIN LAW GROUP, PLLC

BY: STUART H. FINKELSTEIN, ESQ.

338 Jericho Turnpike Syosset, NY 11791

718-261-4900

For the Defendants,
Amy McCloskey, Dimur
Enterprises, Inc., and

Theresa Laurent: LEVIN-EPSTEIN & ASSOCIATES, P.C.

BY: EUNON JASON MIZRAHI, ESQ. 420 Lexington Avenue, Suite 2525

New York, NY 10170

212-792-0048

Transcription Service: Carole Ludwig, Transcription Services

155 East Fourth Street #3C New York, New York 10009

Phone: (212) 420-0771

Email: Transcription420@aol.com

Proceedings conducted telephonically and recorded by electronic sound recording;

Transcript produced by transcription service.

## INDEX

## ${\color{red} {\tt E} \hspace{0.1cm} {\tt X} \hspace{0.1cm} {\tt A} \hspace{0.1cm} {\tt M} \hspace{0.1cm} {\tt I} \hspace{0.1cm} {\tt N} \hspace{0.1cm} {\tt A} \hspace{0.1cm} {\tt T} \hspace{0.1cm} {\tt I} \hspace{0.1cm} {\tt O} \hspace{0.1cm} {\tt N} \hspace{0.1cm} {\tt S}}$

Re- Re- Witness Direct Cross Direct Cross

None

EXHIBITS

None

```
1
                           PROCEEDINGS
 2
             HONORABLE STEWART D. AARON (THE COURT):
                                                       This is
    the matter of Antolini against McCloskey, 19-cv-9038.
 3
                                                            This
 4
    line is being recorded. If I could have the parties
 5
    identify themselves, please, starting with the plaintiff?
             MR. STUART FINKELSTEIN: Stuart Finkelstein for
 6
 7
   plaintiff, Dino Antolini.
             MR. EUNON JASON MIZRAHI: Jason Mizrahi from Levin-
 8
 9
   Epstein & Associates, PC, counsel for defendants. Good
10
    afternoon, your Honor.
11
             THE COURT: All right. Good afternoon.
             I'm going to be making certain rulings here, and
12
13
    I'm going to be following it up with a written order that's
14
    going to say that following a telephone conference today
15
    and for the reasons stated on the record, it is hereby
16
    ordered as follows. I'm going to be, as part of this call,
17
   making annotated comments. So anyone should feel free to
18
    order the transcript, should they so choose.
19
             First, no later than May 7, 2021, "Plaintiffs
20
    shall disclose to defendants, A" -- and I'm quoting --
21
    "statement of the compensation to be paid for the study and
22
    testimony in the case," close quote, as required by
23
   Rule 26(a)(2)(B)(6) of the Federal Rules of Civil
24
    Procedure. Plaintiff admits, in the letter he filed at ECF
25
   number 162, that this information was not provided.
```

1 PROCEEDINGS 2 According to the plaintiff, his expert disclosure states 3 the compensation has not yet been determined. But the 4 purpose of the rule is to allow the opposing party to 5 challenge an expert's credibility and bias, and the Court finds the plaintiff's current disclosures are not in 6 7 compliance with the rule. If plaintiff fails to give this information by May the 7th, plaintiff shall be precluded 8 9 from using this expert at trial. 10 Second, No later than May 14, 2021, defendants 11 shall serve their expert disclosures pursuant to Rule 26(a)(2) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. 12 Ιn 13 my Order dated April 16th, I set today as the deadline for 14 expert disclosures. That's at ECF 157. Defendants filed a 15 letter motion at ECF number 159 seeking to extend that 16 deadline to May the 30th. However, based upon the Court's 17 review of the record and the submissions by the parties, 18 the Court finds that two additional weeks is more than 19 sufficient time for defendants' expert to complete 20 preparation of the required disclosures. If defendants do 21 not abide by that May 14th deadline, defendants shall be 22 precluded from introducing testimony at trial from experts 23 whose disclosures have not been made. 24 Third, no later than May 7, 2021, defendants shall 25 file with the Court a complete copy of the transcript of

1 PROCEEDINGS 2 plaintiff's deposition so that the Court may determine the 3 sanctions, if any, to be imposed upon the parties based 4 upon the conduct that occurred at the deposition, as well 5 as any conditions to impose regarding the continuation of plaintiff's deposition. No further motions or sanctions 6 7 shall be filed by the parties at this time. The Court will provide the parties an opportunity to be heard prior to the 8 9 imposition of any sanctions. During plaintiff's deposition 10 I was called twice. I gave strict warnings there were to 11 be no further speaking objections, and instructions to 12 answer were only to be made based upon privilege. 13 am deeply troubled that plaintiff's deposition was halted 14 by plaintiff's counsel, but I will review the complete 15 transcript before making any rulings as to sanctions. 16 Fourth, other than as set forth in paragraphs one 17 and two, discovery is stayed pending further order of this 18 Court. Once the plaintiff's deposition is concluded, I 19 will set a schedule for any remaining discovery in the 20 case. And, given the nature of this case, I don't expect 21 there'll be much. 22 Are there any questions? 23 MR. FINKELSTEIN: Yes, sir. My question concerns defendants' behavior at the deposition of defendant, Amy 24 25 McCloskey. I pointed out to you and I submitted the

1 PROCEEDINGS 2 transcript there. I haven't heard any ruling from you 3 there regarding sanctions, though, your Honor. 4 THE COURT: You haven't made any motion, you never 5 contacted me in that deposition to talk about the conduct 6 except in one respect. The only respect you contacted me 7 about was an instruction not to answer, and I ruled on that, and I ruled in your favor. I've seen no motion, no 8 9 proper motion made, except for you deciding to file a 10 complete transcript on the record without having authority 11 to do so. There's no basis for me to rule on that, and I 12 decline to rule on that. 13 Any other questions? 14 MR. FINKELSTEIN: When you say you decline to rule 15 on that, you're saying I can't -- you're precluding me from 16 making a motion now on that? 17 THE COURT: Mr. Finkelstein, you have not made a 18 motion. You plainly know how to make motions. I am not 19 ruling on any requests you have attaching a random 20 transcript to a letter that wasn't authorized. You know 21 how to make motions. If you want to make motions, whatever 22 motion you make, if it's properly made, I will rule on it 23 in due course. I'm not ruling on it now. 24 Any other questions --25 MR. FINKELSTEIN: Okay.

```
1
                           PROCEEDINGS
 2
             THE COURT: -- from you before I turn to your
 3
    adversary?
 4
             MR. FINKELSTEIN: No, sir. Not at this time.
 5
             THE COURT: Okay. Mr. Mizrahi, any questions?
 6
             MR. MIZRAHI: Yeah, your Honor. Thank you, again,
 7
    for your attention to this case. I just wanted to be clear
    that the expert disclosure service deadline for defendants
 8
 9
   has been extended to May 14 --
10
             THE COURT: It has.
11
             MR. MIZRAHI: -- and fact discovery is stayed
12
    without a date pending the Court's determination on the
13
   Motion for Sanctions and the conditions to impose on the
14
    continuation of plaintiff's deposition.
15
             THE COURT: No, to be clear, once the deposition
16
    is concluded, I'm going to set a schedule for the remaining
17
    discovery.
18
             MR. MIZRAHI: But how has -- it's unclear -- how
19
    is the -- the Motion for Sanctions, how is it going to
20
    coincide with the continuation of plaintiff's deposition?
21
             THE COURT: I haven't decided yet. I'm likely
22
    going to hold off because I want to see what happens at the
23
    continuation of the deposition to see if the conduct that
    I -- again, I'm going to look at the transcript. I'm
24
25
    reserving a decision on that. But if the conduct
```

```
1
                           PROCEEDINGS
 2
    continues, then I want to keep open the possibility of
 3
   having additional sanctions, if any.
 4
             MR. FINKELSTEIN: So you've already -- your Honor,
 5
   if I may -- I don't know if he's finished yet.
             MR. MIZRAHI: I'm not finished. If I could just
 6
 7
    ask for further clarification, your Honor? You set a
    filing deadline for May 7, 2021, to file the deposition
 8
 9
    transcript --
10
             THE COURT: Yes.
11
             MR. MIZRAHI: -- in order to determine what
12
    sanctions, if any, will be necessary based on the conduct
13
    that occurred at the April 19th deposition.
14
             THE COURT: Yes.
15
             MR. MIZRAHI: And then, subject to that filing,
16
    you were going to be done issuing an Order to impose
17
    certain conditions on the continuation of the deposition.
18
             THE COURT: As required, that's right.
19
             MR. MIZRAHI: Okay, so we should be expecting an
20
    Order reflecting the continuation of the deposition based
21
    on the Order following the filing, of the May 7th filing?
22
             THE COURT: Yes.
23
             MR. MIZRAHI: I understand. Okay. And until
    then, all discovery is just stayed --
24
25
             THE COURT: Except -- except for what's provided
```

```
1
                           PROCEEDINGS
 2
    in paragraphs one and two with respect to expert reports.
 3
             MR. MIZRAHI: Understood, understood.
 4
             The second question I have, your Honor, the expert
 5
   disclosure deadline doesn't necessarily contemplate a
    complete expert fact discovery completion deadline.
 6
 7
    would anticipate possibly taking expert depositions
    following the submittal of expert reports.
 8
                                                I assume
 9
    there's going to be a date held open for the completion of
10
    all discovery after the May 7th file has been submitted?
11
             THE COURT:
                         I will read paragraph four to you
12
    again.
            Other than as set forth in paragraphs one and two
13
    hereof, discovery is stayed pending further order of the
14
            That includes both fact and expert except as to
15
    paragraphs one and two.
16
             MR. MIZRAHI: Thank you, your Honor.
17
             I don't have any further questions at this time.
18
             Mr. Finkelstein?
19
             MR. FINKELSTEIN: Yes. So that I'm clear, he's
20
    going to be given an extension of time, maybe, to depose my
21
    expert even though his time period expired a number of
22
    times.
           That's number one.
23
             Number two --
24
                               I'm going to deal with them one
             THE COURT: No.
25
               I've made no ruling of any kind. All I've done
    at a time.
```

```
1
                                                       10
                           PROCEEDINGS
 2
   is stayed discovery. All I've done is stayed discovery.
 3
             MR. FINKELSTEIN: Well, I'll make the appropriate
 4
   motion, then, at that point if you're extending it in terms
 5
    of their deposing my expert whose report was submitted
 6
   months ago.
 7
             In any event, it sounds to me like you're already
   made a decision that, based upon my requests that I asked
 8
 9
    for in my letter of my relief that the deposition be deemed
10
    waived, any further deposition of my client, based upon
11
    defense counsel's behavior at that deposition. So I'm a
12
    little confused to hear about sanctions and nothing about
13
    them having given up their right and after utilizing the
14
    Rule 30 to continue the deposition or to say if something
15
    was wrong, because they continued the questioning for hours
16
    after the two phone calls to the Court. So I'm wondering
17
    about that, your Honor. If you can clear that up for me,
18
    I'd appreciate it, please.
19
             MR. MIZRAHI: Your Honor, if I --
20
             THE COURT: No --
21
             MR. MIZRAHI: -- to respond?
22
             THE COURT: I do not want you to respond.
23
             Mr. Finkelstein, I have no idea what you've just
24
          Did you want me to read the paragraph again to you
25
    from my Order? Maybe I need to read it -- granted, you
```

```
1
                           PROCEEDINGS
                                                       11
 2
   don't have it in front of you, so I'm happy to read it
 3
    again. Would you like me to do so?
 4
             MR. FINKELSTEIN: I'd appreciate that. Let me see
 5
   if I can clarify my question, then. It sounds to me -- we
   haven't touched on my request that defendants' counsel's
 6
 7
    deposition of plaintiff is waived based upon their behavior
    at the deposition of Mr. Antolini.
 8
 9
             THE COURT: First of all, I've seen no such
10
   motion. And, second of all, I can't imagine that that
11
    relief would be granted, but --
12
             MR. FINKELSTEIN: Why? Why is that --
13
             THE COURT: -- I haven't seen any such motion.
14
             MR. FINKELSTEIN: Okay. So I'm --
15
             THE COURT: I haven't seen the motion. Have
16
    you --
17
             MR. FINKELSTEIN: No, I've got that.
18
             THE COURT: -- prepared any motion?
19
             MR. FINKELSTEIN: I've got that, your Honor, but
20
   how can you decide that it wouldn't be granted even if I
21
    submit the motion?
22
             THE COURT: You stopped the deposition, did you
23
   not?
24
             MR. FINKELSTEIN: No, I didn't. I said to him no
25
   more questions about my arrest, but please continue with
```

```
1
                                                       12
                           PROCEEDINGS
 2
   the deposition of Mr. Antolini. That's what happened,
 3
    Judge.
 4
             THE COURT: Right. So you instructed your witness
 5
   not to --
             MR. FINKELSTEIN: It's all in my letter.
 6
 7
             THE COURT: -- and you instructed the witness not
    to answer, correct?
 8
 9
             MR. FINKELSTEIN: It's all in my submission to the
10
    Court, Judge. It's all part of the record. It's part of
11
   my letter, and it's part of my -- the deposition, the
12
    transcript of the deposition. I've never stopped a
13
    deposition. I told him no more questions regarding my
14
    arrest record, putting it up on the monitors. You have to
15
    have read it, Judge. I'll read it for you if you don't
16
    have it in front of you. And I implored him to continue
17
    with the deposition of Mr. Antolini. He refused to do
18
    that.
19
             THE COURT: Okay. I'm going to read --
20
             MR. MIZRAHI: Your Honor, if I --
21
             THE COURT: -- my Order one more time.
22
             No, I do not wish to hear from you, Mr. Mizrahi.
23
    I'm going to read this paragraph one more time, and I'm
24
    concluding this call. No later than May 7, 2021,
25
    defendants shall file with the Court a complete copy of the
```

## Case 1:19-cv-09038-GBD-SDA Document 170 Filed 05/11/21 Page 13 of 14

```
1
                           PROCEEDINGS
                                                        13
 2
   transcript of plaintiff's deposition so that the Court may
    determine the sanctions, if any, to be imposed upon the
 3
 4
   parties based upon the conduct that occurred at the
 5
    deposition, as well as any conditions to impose regarding
    the continuation of plaintiff's deposition. No further
 6
7
   motions for sanctions shall be filed by the parties at this
    time. The Court will provide the parties an opportunity to
 8
 9
   be heard prior to the imposition of sanctions.
10
             MR. FINKELSTEIN: Okay. I got it. Thank you.
11
             THE COURT: Okay. All right. This matter's
12
    adjourned.
13
              (Whereupon, the matter is recessed.)
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

## Case 1:19-cv-09038-GBD-SDA Document 170 Filed 05/11/21 Page 14 of 14

1	14
2	CERTIFICATE
4	
5	I, Carole Ludwig, certify that the foregoing
6	transcript of proceedings in the case of Antolini v.
7	McCloskey et al, Docket #19-cv-09038-GBD-SDA, was prepared
8	using digital transcription software and is a true and
9	accurate record of the proceedings.
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	Signature Carole Ludwig
15	Carole Ludwig
16	
17	
18	Date: May 11, 2021
19	
20	
21	
22	
23 24	
∠4	